Natural Gas as a Pathway to Alternative Low Carbon Fuels: Infrastructure Issues and Barriers

October 1, 2015

Colin Carter, Professor of Agricultural and Resources Economics, UC Davis
Dan Scheitrum, PhD Candidate, UC Davis
Stylized Facts

State of the Natural Gas Market

• Shale Revolution has led to plentiful, cheap natural gas (NG)
• Relative to diesel fuel, NG is an inexpensive energy source
• Relative to diesel fuel, NG tailpipe emissions are lower, implying potential GHG benefits.

These conditions make natural gas appealing as an emerging alternative fuel source for transportation.
Barriers

• Refueling infrastructure requirements are costly
• With cheap nat gas comes cheap oil
• Emission advantages of NG over diesel may be misunderstood
• Renewable Natural Gas (RNG) has limited commercial potential at current relative prices
Refueling infrastructure requirements are costly

Natural gas as an emerging long-distance fuel is competing against established incumbent diesel and gasoline distribution system

NG Requires:

• Large-scale liquefaction or compression plant
• New pipeline construction to plant
• Delivery by truck to retail location
• Construction of new distribution equipment and storage tanks at refueling station

or

• New pipeline construction to Refueling station
• Small-scale compression or liquefaction equipment on-site
• Construction of new distribution equipment and storage tanks at refueling station

Infrastructure costs are sizeable and require high-volume sales before NG is profitable given the margin between NG and diesel.
Infrastructure requirements are costly

Infrastructure costs can exceed margins between natural gas feedstock price and diesel retail price. Sufficient margin is required in every location to construct a natural gas network.

---

**Component Costs of a Gallon**

![Diagram showing component costs of a gallon between Diesel (Retail) and LNG.](image)

- Feedstock Cost
- Liquefaction Cost
- Transportation Cost
- Electricity Cost
- Station Capital Cost
- Operating Costs

---

**Diesel (Retail)**

1. Feedstock Cost: $0.00
2. Liquefaction Cost: $0.50
3. Transportation Cost: $1.00
4. Electricity Cost: $1.50
5. Station Capital Cost: $2.00
6. Operating Costs: $2.50
7. Total: $6.50

---

**LNG**

1. Feedstock Cost: $1.00
2. Liquefaction Cost: $1.50
3. Transportation Cost: $2.00
4. Electricity Cost: $2.50
5. Station Capital Cost: $3.00
6. Operating Costs: $3.50
7. Total: $13.50

---

**Note:** The above costs are illustrative and subject to market fluctuations and project-specific variations.
With cheap gas comes cheap oil

Production boom of crude oil lagged behind natural gas boom by five years

U.S. Natural Gas and Crude Oil Production

Source: U.S. Energy Information Administration
With cheap gas comes cheap oil

Previously large margins between NG and diesel are disappearing

Natural Gas, Crude and Diesel Prices per gigajoule

Source: U.S. Energy Information Administration
Emissions Advantage?

• Natural gas is promoted as being the cleanest burning alternative fuel with commercial viability.
• Tailpipe emissions are, in some cases, lower than diesel emissions.
• Upstream leakage in pipeline and production coupled with lower NG engine efficiencies potentially eliminate any GHG advantage of NG as a fuel.
Emissions Advantage?

Is renewable natural gas the solution? Not at current prices.

California Total RNG Supply by Source

- MSW
- WWTP
- Dairy
- Landfill
- Fossil
Emissions Advantage?

Is renewable natural gas the solution? Not at current prices.
Emissions Advantage?

Is renewable natural gas the solution? Not at current prices.
Emissions Advantage?

Conditions that promote wide natural gas adoption in the transportation sector not the same as conditions that promote a cleaner NG supply from renewable sources.
Emissions Advantage?

Futures prices indicate: margins expected to remain constant and prices unlikely to increase significantly

Source: CME Group